

Compendium of United Nations Human Rights Treaty Bodies' Statements on Private Actors in Healthcare

Synthesis paper¹

This compendium gathers United Nations human rights treaty bodies' concluding observations related to private involvement in healthcare over 2006-2023. Concluding observations are remarks and recommendations issued by treaty bodies after their periodic review of States' efforts regarding the implementation of their human rights obligations. Concluding observations are interpretations by competent, independent bodies of how the human rights obligations of a State should be implemented and applied. The concerns and recommendations issued by the treaty bodies contribute to ongoing work to elaborate a human rights impact assessment framework for private actors in health services.

United Nations human rights treaty bodies have increasingly engaged with the role of private actors in healthcare. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR), the Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC), the Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD), the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), the Committee against Torture (CAT), as well as the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD) have all addressed this topic, especially regarding marginalised groups. Private healthcare actors comprise private insurance providers, commercial pharmaceutical companies as well as entities involved in managing, financing, or delivering healthcare services.

Some cross-cutting normative elements emerge from this practice, as outlined below.

1

¹ Version 5. Latest revision July 2023.

States must assess the impact of healthcare privatisation plans and ensure that they do not impede the realisation of the right to health.

- "Ensure that the policy of **the privatization of health**, education and other services does not deprive women of continuous access to good quality basic services.²
- "Review the probable effects of its plans to privatize portions of the national health-care system on the most disadvantaged and marginalized sectors of society".³
- "(...) balance the roles of public and private health providers in order to maximize resources and the reach of health services. It calls upon the State party to monitor the privatization of health care and its impact on the health of poor women and provide such information in its next periodic report."⁴
- "(...) ensure that the **privatization of the health sector** and the devolution to the provinces of the main health competence do not reduce further the **already limited health services accessible to women**."⁵
- "(...) ensure that privatization of the health system does not impede the enjoyment of the right to health, in particular for the disadvantaged and marginalized individuals and groups."⁶

States must monitor and regulate private healthcare providers.

- "(...) Establish a systematic monitoring mechanism **for private care institutions**, with a view to ensuring compliance with minimum quality standards."
- "(...) take measures to improve accessible health-care services for children with disabilities, including sexual and reproductive health, (...) require private

² CEDAW, 'Concluding observations of the combined seventh and eight periodic reports of Hungary', CEDAW/C/HUN/CO/7-8 (26 March 2013), para.9 (d).

³ CESCR, 'Concluding observations on the initial report of Croatia', E/C.12/1/Add.73 (5 December 2001), para. 34.

⁴ CEDAW 'Concluding observations on the combined second and third reports of India' (2 February 2007), para 41.

⁵ CEDAW 'Concluding observations on the fourth periodic report of Pakistan' CEDAW/C/PAK/CO/4 (27 March 2013), para. 32 (e).

⁶ CESCR 'Concluding observations on fifth periodic report of Poland' E/C.12/POL/CO/5 (2 December 2009), para. 29.

⁷ CRC 'Concluding observations on the combined second to fourth periodic reports of Brazil' CRC/C/BRA/CO/2-4 (30 October 2015), para. 46 (c).

service providers to implement universal design of equipment and accessible information to children with disabilities in the health system."⁸

Public-private partnerships are questionable in light of the obligations to use resources effectively.

• "Review whether the practice of **contracting out** the delivery of basic services to private actors constitutes an **optimal use of available resources.**"

States must ensure that private health insurance does not impinge on equal access to healthcare.

- "(...) take all the measures necessary to improve, in both qualitative and quantitative terms, its public health-care services (...) introducing a common waiting list for treatment in publicly funded hospitals **for privately and publicly insured patients** (...)."¹⁰
- "(...) ensure that **private insurance providers** do not deny access to schemes operated by them nor impose unreasonable eligibility conditions, with a view to ensuring the right to equal, adequate, affordable and accessible health care to all."¹¹
- "(...) concerned that the quality and the availability of the health services provided under the scheme have been adversely affected by the large-scale privatization of the health service in the State party, impacting in particular on the poorest sections of the population."¹²
- "(...) concerned about: **The reduction in public funds allocated to health care and the partial privatization of the sector**, which is having a detrimental impact on the health of women, in particular those belonging to disadvantaged and marginalized groups."¹³

⁸ CRC 'Concluding observations on the combined fifth and sixth periodic reports of Costa Rica' CRC/C/CRI/CO/5-6 (4 March 2020), para 35 (f).

⁹ CESCR 'Concluding observations on the second periodic report of Lebanon' E/C.12/LBN/CO/2 (24 October 2016), para. 11.

¹⁰ CESCR 'Concluding observations on the third periodic report of Ireland' E/C.12/IRL/CO/3 (8 July 2015), para. 28 (recommendations)

¹¹ CESCR 'Concluding observations on the second periodic report of the Czech Republic' E/C.12/CZE/CO/2 (23 June 2014), para 15.

¹² CESCR 'Concluding observations on the fifth periodic report of India' E/C.12/IND/CO/5 (8 August 2008), para 38.

¹³ CEDAW 'Concluding observations on the seventh periodic report of Italy' CEDAW/C/ITA/CO/7 (24 July 2017), para 41(a).

States must address disparities between public and private healthcare systems, improving the quality of public healthcare services.

"(...) address the large disparities between the public and private health-care systems, as well as between rural and urban areas, by securing a sufficient number of medical professionals, improving medical equipment and expanding the range and improving the quality of public health-care services."¹⁴

Methodology

The concluding observations were retrieved from the <u>Universal Human Rights Index</u>, a freely accessible database of U.N. human rights bodies' standards maintained by the U.N. Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights. The database currently covers the period 1999-2023. The search was run for the following 6 UN Treaty bodies: Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (<u>CESCR</u>), Committee on the Rights of the Child (<u>CRC</u>), Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (<u>CRPD</u>), Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (<u>CEDAW</u>), Committee against Torture (<u>CAT</u>) and the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (<u>CERD</u>). The keywords used were "right to health" and "sexual & reproductive health and rights" as filters. Key words used were: "privat*", "commercial*, "market*" and "commodif*". The filters applied are for the following human rights themes: "right to health" and "sexual and reproductive healthcare". Last search was conducted on 10 July 2023.

The concluding observations found were then manually reviewed and kept in the database if they met the following criteria:

- They explicitly analyse the role of private actors in healthcare, such as private healthcare providers (hospitals, clinics, laboratories) and private insurance companies.
- They raise issues explicitly related to the right to health, in particular equal access to healthcare services.

This resulted in the selection of the following 55 Concluding Observations.

 $^{^{14}}$ CESCR 'Concluding observations on the initial report of South Africa' E/C.12/ZAF/CO/1 (29 November 2018), para 64 (b).

UN Treaty Body Statements on Private Actors in Healthcare

Database

STATE	BODY AND DOCUMENT	KEY EXTRACTS
Bahrain	CRC, Concluding observations on the initial report of Bahrain, CRC/C/15/Add.175, 11 March 2002, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CRC%2FC%2F15%2F Add.175⟪=en	13. While noting information provided by the delegation with respect to increased investments in the health and education sectors, the Committee is concerned about the increasing trends towards the privatization of these sectors and the potentially negative consequences this may have on the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights by all children in Bahrain.
Bulgaria	CESCR, Concluding observations on the third periodic report of Bulgaria, E/C.12/1/Add.37, 8 December 1999, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E%2FC.12%2F1%2FA dd.37⟪=en	6. The Committee notes with satisfaction that despite the privatization of health services, medicines will continue to be distributed free of charge to the disadvantaged groups of society, and that mental health services will remain public.
Brazil	CRC,	46. In this regard, the Committee recommends that the State party: ():

	Concluding observations on the combined second to fourth periodic reports of Brazil, CRC/C/BRA/CO/2-4, 30 October 2015, available at: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CRC/C/BRA/CO/2-4⟪=En	(c) Establish a systematic monitoring mechanism for private care institutions , with a view to ensuring compliance with minimum quality standards.
Cabo Verde	CESCR, Concluding observations on the initial report of Cabo Verde, E/C.12/CPV/CO/1, 27 November 2018, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E/C.12/CPV/CO/1&La ng=En	57. The Committee recommends that the State party: () (b) Monitor public and private health facilities for accessibility on a regular basis and adapt them to the needs of persons with disabilities, and ensure that information is made accessible to persons with a visual impairment.
Chile	CRC, Concluding observations on the combined fourth and fifth periodic reports of Chile, CRC/C/CHL/CO/4-5, 30 October 2015, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc	58. The Committee is still concerned about the lack of an integral system of health care for all children up to age 18, the difference in quality between public and private health-care services, the increased medication of children diagnosed with attention deficit hyperactivity disorder (ADHD) and both the undernourishment and obesity levels among children.

	hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CRC/C/CHL/CO/4- 5⟪=En	
Chile	CEDAW, Concluding observations on the seventh periodic report of Chile, CEDAW/C/CHL/CO/7, 9 March 2018, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CEDAW/C/CHL/CO/7 ⟪=En	 39. In line with its general recommendation No. 24 on women and health, the Committee recommends that the State party: (b) Apply strict justification requirements to prevent the blanket use of conscientious objection by doctors refusing to perform abortions, in particular in cases of teenage pregnancy, and ensure that such measures also apply to medical personnel in private clinics;
Costa Rica	CRC, Concluding observations on the combined fifth and sixth periodic reports of Costa Rica, CRC/C/CRI/CO/5-6, 4 March 2020, available at: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=cRC%2fC%2fCRI%2fCO%2f5-6⟪=en	35. () the Committee recommends that the State party: () (f) Take measures to improve accessible health-care services for children with disabilities, including sexual and reproductive health, allocate financial resources to reinforce accessibility to medical infrastructure, and require private service providers to implement universal design of equipment and accessible information to children with disabilities in the health system.
Croatia	CESCR, Concluding observations on the	34. The Committee recommends that the State party carefully review the probable effects of its plans to privatize portions of the national health-care

	initial report of Croatia, E/C.12/1/Add.73, 5 December 2001, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E/C.12/1/Add.73&La ng=En	system on the most disadvantaged and marginalized sectors of society, including, in particular, the unemployed and underemployed, the homeless and those living in poverty.
Cyprus	CEDAW, Concluding observations of the eighth periodic report	40. The Committee () is concerned about: (c) The lack of clear regulations and protocols to ensure the effective implementation of the new law
of Cyprus, on a	on abortion, the insufficient availability of abortion	
	CEDAW/C/CYP/CO/8, 25 July 2018, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno	services in public hospitals and the high cost of such services in private clinics, the lack of private private and post-abortion counselling services in public are private hospitals and the lack of training for health-care providers on the application of the new law.
	=CEDAW/C/CYP/CO/8 ⟪=En	41. The Committee () recommends ():
		(c) Fully apply the law decriminalizing abortion, including through the adoption of clear regulations and protocols , provide regular training to health-care providers on the law's application and adopt procedures to guarantee access to abortion services and pre- and postabortion counselling services in public and private hospitals .
Cyprus	CRC,	30.The Committee is seriously concerned about the following:

	Concluding observations of the combined fifth and sixth periodic reports of Cyprus, CRC/C/CYP/CO/5-6, 24 June 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org/en/document/a6f7bde6-0019-46c4-a8d5-99dcfa21ab5d	() (d) The lack of access to public health care, including early detection and rehabilitation, forcing parents to cover the costs of private health-care services;
Czech Republic	CESCR, Concluding observations of the second periodic report of the Czech Republic, E/C.12/CZE/CO/2, 23 June 2014, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E/C.12/CZE/CO/2&La ng=En	15. () The Committee is further concerned at reports that migrants have been refused enrolment in private health insurance schemes or asked to pay prohibitive premiums, in contravention of the provisions of the Covenant and the State party's Anti-Discrimination Act (art. 9) () The Committee also urges the State party to ensure that private insurance providers do not deny access to schemes operated by them nor impose unreasonable eligibility conditions, with a view to ensuring the right to equal, adequate, affordable and accessible health care to all.
Czech Republic	CESCR, Concluding observations on the third periodic report of the Czech Republic, E/C.12/CZE/CO/3, 28 March 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org	38. The Committee is concerned at the persistence of discrimination against migrants who do not meet the conditions for joining the public health insurance system and have to enroll in a private health insurance plan, where they are exposed to gaps in coverage, waiting times for payment of insurance indemnity and limits to the maximum amount of reimbursement. 39. The Committee recommends that the State party:

	/en/document/8e7b7 81d-018d-4e99-91ae- 9ba5f48ab6fd	(b) Guarantee that private insurance providers do not impose unreasonable conditions ;
Czech Republic	CRC, Concluding observations on the combined fifth and sixth periodic reports of Czechia, CRC/C/CZE/CO/5-6, 22 October 2021, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org/en/document/2887a7b1-f0ea-41f5-b239-b2d95d8045ea .	43. While noting the implementation of the State integration programme, the Committee is concerned about the following: (e) The lack of access to public health insurance for migrant children and the exclusion from private insurance of newborn and/or seriously ill children whose parents are neither permanent residents nor asylum seekers, resulting in a significant debt burden on migrant families and children;
Egypt	CESCR, Concluding observations on the combined second to fourth periodic reports of Egypt, E/C.12/EGY/CO/2-4, 13 December 2013, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/ layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E/C.12/EGY/CO/2- 4⟪=En	21. The Committee is concerned that health-care expenditure as a percentage of the budget of the State party has declined significantly; resulting in a fragmented and increasingly privatized health-care system. It is also concerned that this results in a large percentage of the population, particularly those in vulnerable situations, being excluded from health insurance and deprived of access to health facilities, goods and services ().
El Salvador	CESCR, Concluding observations on the second periodic report of El Salvador, E/C.12/SLV/CO/2,	24. The Committee considers that the budget allocated for the health sector is insufficient in order to provide adequate coverage for the population, in particular for vulnerable groups. It notes that access to health services is limited owing to the lack of financial means allocated by the State party to the public sector, and by the preference

	27 June 2007, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E%2FC.12%2FSLV%2 FCO%2F2⟪=en	for a private-sector approach to the management, financing and provision of services, to the detriment of those who are unable to pay for such services.
Guatemala	CESCR, Concluding observations on the	22. The Committee finds it regrettable that the health budget is insufficient to provide adequate coverage for the entire population, thereby favouring the
	third periodic report of Guatemala, E/C.12/GTM/CO/3,	private provision of health-care services (art. 12).
	9 December 2014, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E/C.12/GTM/CO/3	
Hungary	CEDAW, Concluding observations on the combined seventh and eighth periodic reports of Hungary,	8. () The Committee also notes the widespread privatization of health, education and other social services in the State party and is concerned that this may hinder the enjoyment of rights under the Convention.
	CEDAW/C/HUN/CO/7- 8,	9. The Committee urges the State party to ():
	26 March 2013, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno	(d) Ensure that the policy of the privatization of health, education and other services does not deprive women of continuous access to good quality basic services in the field of economic, social and cultural rights.

	=CEDAW/C/HUN/CO/ 7-8⟪=En	
India	CRC, Concluding observations on the combined third and fourth periodic reports of India, CRC/C/IND/CO/3-4, 7 July 2014, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CRC/C/IND/CO/3- 4⟪=En	 63. The Committee notes the various policies and programmes in place in the State party to improve children's health and their access to health services. However, it is deeply concerned about the persistence of disparities in the quality of and access to health services between urban and rural areas as well as the State party's increasing reliance on the private sector to provide health services. It is also concerned about the high cost of health services for the population and the lack of regulation of the quality of services provided. 64.The Committee recommends that the State party: (a) Strengthen its efforts to address, as a matter of urgency, the existing disparities in access to and quality of health services, including by establishing partnerships with the private sector so as to increase access to, and
		affordability of, health services and by regulating the services that they provide; ().
India	CESCR, Concluding observations on the fifth periodic report of India, E/C.12/IND/CO/5,	38. Committee is also concerned that the quality and the availability of the health services provided under the scheme have been adversely affected by the large-scale privatization of the health service in the State party, impacting in particular on the poorest sections of the population.
	8 August 2008, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno	78. The Committee also requests the State party to provide information on the measures to regulate the private health-care sector.

	=E/C.12/IND/CO/5&La ng=En	
India	CEDAW, Concluding observations on the combined second and third periodic report of India, CEDAW/C/IND/CO/2- 3, 2 February 2007, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/ layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CEDAW%2FC%2FIND %2FCO%2F3⟪=e n	 40. In addition, the Committee is concerned that the privatization of health services has an adverse impact on women's capacity to access such services. 41. It calls upon the State party to balance the roles of public and private health providers in order to maximize resources and the reach of health services. It calls upon the State party to monitor the privatization of health care and its impact on the health of poor women and provide such information in its next periodic report.
Indonesia	CRPD, Concluding observations on the second periodic report of Indonesia, CRPD/C/IDN/CO/2, 12 October 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org /en/document/a4d09 cb3-05b6-43f3-87ff- 984cadb9472a	41. The Committee recommends that the State party prohibit forced medical interventions, including forced psychiatric interventions, forced contraception and forced sterilization of persons with disabilities, in public and private institutions.
Ireland	CERD,	37. The committee is concerned about.
	Concluding observations on the	(b)The operation of direct provision centres by private actors on a for-profit basis without

	fifth to ninth report of Ireland, CERD/C/IRL/CO/5-9 23 January 2020, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org/en/document/fc3b6c24-9713-43f2-80f3-cf45b400aa07	proper regulation or accountability mechanisms.
Ireland	CESCR, Concluding observations on the third periodic report of Ireland, E/C.12/IRL/CO/3, 8 July 2015, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E/C.12/IRL/CO/3&La ng=En	28. The Committee is concerned at the overall deterioration of health services due to significant budget cuts (), in particular, the: (a) Widening disparities between people with and those without private health insurance in accessing medical services. () () The Committee recommends that the State party take all the measures necessary to improve, in both qualitative and quantitative terms, its public health-care services () introducing a common waiting list for treatment in publicly funded hospitals for privately and publicly insured patients ().
Italy	CEDAW, Concluding observations on the seventh periodic report of Italy: CEDAW/C/ITA/CO/7, 24 July 2017, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc	 41. The Committee is concerned about: (a) The reduction in public funds allocated to health care and the partial privatization of the sector, which is having a detrimental impact on the health of women, in particular those belonging to disadvantaged and marginalized group.

Japan	hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CEDAW/C/ITA/CO/7 ⟪=En CRPD, Concluding observations on the initial report of Japan, CRPD/C/JPN/CO/1, 7 October 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org /en/document/8ebab 7ca-08d9-4952-a4b5- 522eb75ed270	54. Taking into account the links between article 25 of the Convention and targets 3.7 and 3.8 of the Sustainable Development Goals, the Committee recommends that the State party: (a) Ensure quality and gender-sensitive health-care services for all persons with disabilities, including by ensuring the implementation of accessibility standards and the provision of reasonable accommodation by public and private health-care providers;
Jordan	CRPD, Concluding observations on the initial report of Jordan: CRPD/C/JOR/CO/1, 15 May 2017, available at: https://tbinternet.oh chr.org/_layouts/15/ treatybodyexternal/ Download.aspx?sym bolno=CRPD/C/JOR/ CO/1⟪=En	 47. The Committee notes with concern the restrictions imposed on persons with disabilities, in particular those with psychosocial or neurological disabilities, to subscribe to private health insurance. It is also concerned that health-care professionals lack training on the human rights of persons with disabilities, particularly those with intellectual and/or psychosocial disabilities. 48. In line with article 25 of the Convention and Sustainable Development Goal 3, the Committee recommends that the State party: (a) Enact legislation explicitly recognizing the right of persons with disabilities to enjoy all private health insurance services covered by private insurance companies on an equal basis with others;
Kenya	CAT, Concluding observations on the	27. The Committee welcomes the waiver on maternity fees in public hospitals but remains concerned about ill-treatment of women who seek access to

	second periodic report of Kenya, CAT/C/KEN/CO/2, 19 June 2013, available at: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT/C/KEN/CO/2⟪=En	reproductive health services, in particular the ongoing practice of post-delivery detention of women unable to pay their medical bills, including in private health facilities. The Committee is further concerned by occurrences of forced and coerced sterilization of HIV positive women and women with disabilities (arts. 2, 12 and 16). () The Committee urges the State party to strengthen its efforts to end the practice of forcible detention of post-delivery mothers for non-payment of fees, including in private health facilities.
Kuwait	CPRD, Concluding observations on the initial report of Kuwait, CRPD/C/KWT/CO/1, 18 October 2019, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CRPD%2fC%2fKWT% 2fCO%2f1⟪=en	48. The Committee is concerned about: (a) Insufficient access to quality and affordable health-care services for Bidoon and non-Kuwaiti children and adults with disabilities, who are therefore obliged to seek private health care at their own expense;
Lebanon	CEDAW, Concluding observations on the combined fourth and fifth periodic reports of Lebanon, CEDAW/C/LBN/CO/4- 5, 24 November 2015, available at:	 41. The Committee is also concerned about the insufficient monitoring of private health-care providers, which are the majority providers of specialized health services for women. 42. The Committee recommends that the State party () take measures to adequately monitor the performance of private health-care providers ()

	https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CEDAW/C/LBN/CO/4 -5⟪=En	
Lebanon	CESCR, Concluding observations on the second periodic report of Lebanon, E/C.12/LBN/CO/2, 24 October 2016, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E/C.12/LBN/CO/2&L ang=En	 10. The Committee is concerned that, as no public budget has been adopted since 2005, the budgeting process lacks democratic approval and oversight and that the current sectoral allocations no longer correspond to the needs and priorities in the State party. The Committee also notes that a considerable part of the public budget for health and education is spent on contracts for the delivery of services by private schools and private medical facilities (art. 2 (1)). 11. The Committee calls on the State party to overcome the political obstacles to engaging in a regular budgetary process so as to ensure accountability and adequate allocations to priority needs and sectors. The Committee also recommends that the State party review whether the practice of contracting out the delivery of basic services to private actors constitutes an optimal use of available resources to ensuring Covenant rights without discrimination.
Lebanon	CRC, Concluding observations on the second periodic report of Lebanon, CRC/C/15/Add.169, 21 March 2002, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/ layouts/15/tre	42. [] The Committee is deeply concerned that children do not enjoy equal access to quality health care owing to the high cost of health care and the failure of insurance schemes to provide full coverage, and in part to the domination of the health sector by the private sector and significant differences between the quality of the care provided by the public versus the private sector.

	atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CRC%2FC%2F15%2F Add.169⟪=en	
Macedonia	CESCR, Concluding observations on the combined second to fourth periodic reports of the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia E/C.12/MKD/CO/2-4, 15 July 2016, available at: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=E%2fC.12%2fMKD%2fCO%2f2-4⟪=en	 47. It [the Committee] is also concerned that some private health-service providers charge fees for services that should be provided free of charge, as stipulated by the licensing agreements under which they operate (art. 12). 48. It [the Committee] urges the State party to put an immediate end to the practice of illegally charging fees and to monitor the compliance of private health-service providers with the licensing agreements under which they operate.
Mauritani a	CESCR, Concluding observations on the initial report of Mauritania, E.C.12/MRT/CO/1, 10 December 2012, available at:	26. The Committee is concerned at the inadequate monitoring and control exercised by the State party over the functioning of private medical service providers as well as the pricing and the quality of medical supplies on the market. The Committee is also concerned at the absence of adequate laws regulating the practice of traditional medicine (art. 12). The Committee urges the State party to take appropriate measures for the effective enforcement of existing laws applicable to health care in the private sector as well as to the pricing and quality of medical supplies on the market.

Mexico	CRPD, Concluding observations on the second and third periodic reports of Mexico, CRPD/C/MEX/CO/2- 3,20 April 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org /en/document/8a7e6 38f-259f-404b-b1f7- 4851be144c86	47. The Committee further recommends that the State party implement training programmes for professionals in the public and private health sectors on sexual and reproductive health rights of women and girls with disabilities that include training on CRPD/C/MEX/CO/2-3 9 respect for their preferences and on dismantling prevalent stereotypes of the sexuality of women and girls with disabilities.
Mongolia	CEDAW, Concluding observations on the third and fourth periodic reports of Mongolia, A/56/38(SUPP), 29 January 2001, available at: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=A%2F56%2F38(SUPP)⟪=en	 267. The Committee expresses its deep concern at the negative impact of privatization on women's access to adequate health care and education. 268. The Committee calls upon the Government to ensure that these services are not reduced and that, in particular, the areas of health and education do not suffer as a result of privatization.
Pakistan	CEDAW, Concluding observations on the fourth periodic report of Pakistan, CEDAW/C/PAK/CO/4, 27 March 2013, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/ layouts/15/tre	31. The Committee is concerned about the high maternal mortality rate in the State party, women's lack of adequate access to family planning services, including contraceptives, restrictive abortion laws and the large number of women resorting to unsafe abortions, as well as the lack of adequate postabortion care services. It is further concerned at the wide privatization of the health system and the inadequate budget allocated to the health sector, in particular with regard to sexual and

	atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CEDAW%2FC%2FPA K%2FCO%2F4⟪= en	reproductive health-care services, especially in rural remote areas. 32. The Committee calls upon the State party: (e) To ensure that the privatization of the health sector and the devolution to the provinces of the main health competence do not reduce further the already limited health services accessible to women.
Pakistan	CESCR, Concluding observations on the initial report of Pakistan, E/C.12/PAK/CO/1, 20 July 2017, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E/C.12/PAK/CO/1&La ng=En	75. The Committee is concerned at the very low level of public funding allocated to the health sector; the insufficient coverage of the National Health Insurance Programme; and the weak public health system that has led to the heavy reliance on private health services.
Poland	CESCR, Concluding observations on the fifth periodic report of Poland, E/C.12/POL/CO/5, 2 December 2009, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno	29. The Committee notes with concern the continuous decrease in public spending on health and the negative consequences thereof on the enjoyment of right to health. The Committee is also concerned that the gradual privatization of health care risks making it less accessible and affordable (art. 12). The Committee recommends that the State party increase its budget allocation for health in order to meet the growing number of emerging health-care issues in the country and ensure that privatization of the health system does not impede the enjoyment of the right to health, in

	=E%2FC.12%2FPOL%2 FCO%2F5⟪=en	particular for the disadvantaged and marginalized individuals and groups.
Poland	CRPD,	23. The Committee is concerned about: ()
	Concluding observations on the initial report of Poland, CRPD/C/POL/CO/1, 29 October 2018, available at: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno	 (c) The lack of independent monitoring of public and private care and mental-health facilities; 24. The Committee recommends that the State party: () (d) Develop monitoring mechanisms for public and private care and mental-health facilities. 30. The Committee is concerned about () reports of so-called "conversion therapy" being conducted by
	=CRPD%2fC%2fPOL% 2fCO%2f1⟪=en	public and private health entities on lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender plus persons without their consent, and based upon the presumed psychosocial impairment of the person.
Portugal	CEDAW,	41. The Committee recommends that the State party:
	Concluding observations on the tenth periodic report of Portugal,	(c) Ensure the full, free and informed consent of women with disabilities for any intervention or medical treatment, train health professionals on human rights, dignity, autonomy and the needs of
	CEDAW/C/PRT/CO/10,	women with disabilities, and promulgate ethical standards for public and private health care.
	12 July 2022, available at:	2.3aa. aa ta' paana ana piirata naatii talt.
	https://uhri.ohchr.org /en/document/88d47 6a9-f7de-48a8-943c- 17117b3f3cda	
Republic of Korea	CESCR, Concluding observations on the third periodic report	22. The Committee is concerned that the rapid pace of economic growth — of unprecedented proportions in Asia — that has turned the country into the twelfth-largest economy has not been matched by greater fulfilment of economic, social and cultural

of the Republic of Korea,

E/C.12/KOR/CO/3,

17 December 2009, available at:

https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =E%2FC.12%2FKOR% 2FCO%2F3&Lang=en rights, in particular for the most disadvantaged and marginalized individuals and groups. [...] The Committee is therefore **concerned at inadequate public social expenditure and the high level of privatization of social services, including health care**, education, water and electricity supplies, which has led to greater difficulties in the access and use of such services by the most disadvantaged and marginalized individuals and groups.

30. The Committee is concerned that, despite the medical benefit programme, disadvantaged and marginalized individuals do not have adequate access to medical services in privately run hospitals, which constitute 90 per cent of all hospitals. The Committee is also concerned that the national health insurance scheme only covers around 65 per cent of total medical expenses and that, as a result, out-of-pocket payments are substantial (art. 12). The Committee urges the State party to increase expenditure for health care and to take all appropriate measures to ensure universal access to health care, at prices that are affordable to everyone, and draws the attention of the State party to its general comment No. 14 (2000) on the right to the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health.

Republic of Korea

CESCR,

Concluding observations on the fourth periodic report of the Republic of Korea, E/C.12/KOR/CO/4, 19 October 2017, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow

- 44. While noting the plan of the State party to expand the coverage of national health insurance, the Committee is concerned that its restrictive coverage leads to a heavy financial burden on households through out-of-pocket medical expenses and expensive private insurance premiums.
- 45. In the context of the **highly privatised health system**, the Committee urges the State party to ensure the adequacy of the coverage of national health insurance so that health care is affordable,

	nload.aspx?symbolno =E/C.12/KOR/CO/4&L ang=En	especially for disadvantaged and marginalised groups.
Singapore	CRPD, Concluding observations on the initial report of Singapore, CRPD/C/SGP/CO/1, 5 October 2022, available at:	43. The Committee is concerned about the protection of data of persons with disabilities in the health-care system, including in private practices, hospitals and institutions. It is also concerned about practices that require persons with disabilities to disclose their impairment in relationships with private entities such as employers and insurance providers.
	https://uhri.ohchr.org /en/document/919c8 882-b4cf-4af2-9888- 98160afca27f	49. The Committee notes with satisfaction the information provided by the State party that it is planning to withdraw its reservation to article 25 (e) of the Convention upon the adoption of the guidelines for private insurers. However, it is concerned about: (a) The barriers faced by autistic persons to access to private health and life insurance schemes and the associated conditions;
Sri Lanka	CESCR, Concluding observations on the fifth periodic report of Sri Lanka, E/C.12/LKA/CO/5, 4 August 2017, available at: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=E%2fC.12%2fLKA%2fCO%2f5⟪=en	57. The Committee is concerned that the public health-care system is characterized by a very low and decreasing expenditure as a percentage of GDP, regional disparities in health-care infrastructure, long waiting lists for specialist care, high out-of-pocket health expenses, high prices of medicines and expensive private medical care.

Sri Lanka

CRC,

Concluding observations on the combined fifth and sixth periodic reports of Sri Lanka, CRC/C/LKA/CO/5-6,

- 2 March 2018, available at: https://tbinternet.ohc hr.org/_layouts/15/tre atybodyexternal/Dow nload.aspx?symbolno =CRC%2fC%2fLKA%2f CO%2f5-6&Lang=en
- 30. While noting with appreciation the **provision of free health care to all citizens**, the Committee, with reference to its general comment No. 15 (2013) on the right of the child to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of health, recommends that the State party:
 - (b) Combat high out-of-pocket health expenses, high prices of medicines and expensive private medical care, with a view to ensuring that each child has equal access to quality public health care.

South Africa

CESCR,

Concluding observations on the initial report of South Africa, E/C.12/ZAF/CO/1,

29 November 2018, available at:
https://tbinternet.ohc
hr.org/ layouts/15/tre
atybodyexternal/Dow
nload.aspx?symbolno
=E%2fC.12%2fZAF%2f
CO%2f1&Lang=en

- 63. While noting that the State party aims to achieve universal health-care coverage through the adoption of the National Health Insurance Bill, the Committee is concerned at **the large disparities between the public and private health-care systems**, **with the public system at a disadvantage** in relation to the number of medical professionals, medical equipment and medical expenditure, as well as between rural and urban areas in registering with the National Health Insurance Fund and accessing health-care services (...).
- 64. The Committee recommends that the State party:
 - (b) Address the large disparities between the public and private health-care systems, as well as between rural and urban areas, by securing a sufficient number of medical professionals, improving medical equipment and expanding the range and improving the quality of public health-care services, particularly in the primary and community health-care sectors and in rural areas;

Switzerlan	CRPD,	50. The Committee recommends that the State party:
d	Concluding observations on the initial report of Switzerland, CRPD/C/CHE/CO/1, 13 April 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org/en/document/010ef4 05-2f41-4427-a39b-78f31a850294	(a) Ensure that persons with disabilities have access to high-quality, gender sensitive and affordable health-care services at the federal and cantonal levels without discrimination, including by ensuring the implementation of accessibility standards and the provision of reasonable accommodation by public and private health providers; (b) Develop professional training and continuing education for public and private health professionals on the human rights of persons with disabilities and the requirement for accessibility and reasonable accommodation in all aspects of healthcare provision;
		(b) Develop professional training and continuing education for public and private health professionals on the human rights of persons with disabilities and the requirement for accessibility and reasonable accommodation in all aspects of health-care provision;
Switzerlan d	CEDAW, Concluding observations on the sixth periodic report on Switzerland, CEDAW/CHE/CO/6, 1 November 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org/en/document/44ea3f 3d-1e9c-4de2-a8a0- c5d7ffe447b1	(c) 56. The Committee recommends that the State party () (a) Ensure that migrant women in an irregular situation have effective access to hospitals and health-care services, including sexual and reproductive health-care services, by removing any reporting obligations for public and private health-care providers;
Tajikistan	CESCR, Concluding observations on the fourth periodic report	52. The Committee is concerned about restrictions on access to health care, particularly for disadvantaged groups, owing to budgetary constraints, a shortage of medical professionals and poor infrastructure of medical facilities. The Committee is particularly

	of Tajikstan, E/C.12/TJK/CO/4 10 November 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org /Document/File/c395 6e93-c025-4ec1-aa62- 7bfe84e32ef3/314A20 51-84EE-4033-B7FF- F6BE34072AF6	concerned about the increase in the prices of medical services owing to the privatization of medical services (art. 12). 53. The Committee recommends that the State party allocate sufficient resources to the health sector and ensure the availability, accessibility and quality of health services, including by securing a sufficient amount of qualified medical personnel and ensuring adequate medical equipment, infrastructure and facilities. It also recommends that the State party ensure that any public-private partnership has no negative impact on the affordability of medical services, particularly for the most disadvantaged persons.
Togo	CESCR, Concluding Observations on the initial report of Togo, E/C.12/TGO/CO/1, 3 June 2013, available at: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=E/C.12/TGO/CO/1	30. The Committee is concerned by the proliferation of unauthorized private medical practitioners and the illegal market for pharmaceutical products, the quality of which cannot be guaranteed. The Committee recommends that the State party ensure that no unauthorized medical practitioners may practice medicine in the State party.
Türkiye	CEDAW, Concluding observations on the eighth periodic report of Türkiye, CEDAW/C/TUR/CO/8,	47. The Committee reiterates its concerns (b) That the policy of free contraceptives and the legal framework on abortion are under attack by highlevel representatives of the Government, and a large number of public hospitals refuse to perform abortions even though termination of pregnancy is legal up to the tenth week of pregnancy, which

Ukraine	12 July 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org /en/document/ba8f54 74-7cb5-43e5-869c- 705c7030335d CESCR, Concluding	 compels many women to resort to expensive private clinics or unsafe abortion. 42. It notes with concern the lack of information provided on the privatization of certain opioid
	observations on the seventh periodic report of Ukraine, E/C.12/UKR/CO/7, 2 April 2020, available at: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=E/C.12/UKR/CO/7⟪=En	 substitution therapy programmes and the authorities' oversight of these programmes (art. 12). 43. The Committee also encourages the State party to continue its effort to expand harm reduction programmes, particularly in prisons, and ensure the quality and adequacy of the privatized opioid substitution therapy programmes.
United Arab Emirates	CEDAW, Concluding observations on the fourth periodic report of the United Arab Emirates, CEDAW/C/ARE/CO/4, 12 July 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org/en/document/e4cb4-516-e084-4b24-b094-e79e47c6959f	48. The Committee notes with concern that women without a marriage certificate and girls in the State party are unable to access certain sexual and reproductive health services in public and private hospitals.
Vietnam	CESCR, Concluding observations on the	22. The Committee is concerned that, in spite of the progress achieved in expanding enrolment in health insurance, its low coverage among workers

	combined second to fourth periodic reports of Vietnam, E/C.12/VNM/CO/2-4, 15 December 2014, available at: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=E/C.12/VNM/CO/2-4⟪=En	in the informal economy as well as the co-payment requirement impedes access to health care among disadvantaged and marginalized groups. The Committee notes also with concern the limited availability of quality health-care services, particularly in remote areas. Additionally, the Committee is concerned at the health protection divide in the society and at the adverse impact of privatization on the affordability of health care. The Committee recommends that the State party: ()
		(b) Ensure that health insurance co-payments remain affordable for all, including socially disadvantaged groups, and expand the list of prescribed medicines under the insurance scheme so as to limit out-of-pocket payments;(c) Invest in the improvement of the quality of health - care services in community health centres and district hospitals.
Zambia	CRC, Concluding observations on the combined fifth to seventh periodic reports of Zambia, CRC/C/ZMB/CO/5-7, 27 June 2022, available at: https://uhri.ohchr.org/en/document/0bec897d-949c-4c47-aaef-ece1983c5eb1.	 32. Recalling its general comment No. 15 (2013) on the right of the child to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of health, and targets 2.2, 3.1, 3.2 and 3.8 of the Sustainable Development Goals, the Committee recommends that the State party: (a) Strengthen awareness about the National Health Insurance Scheme among the public, pharmacy personnel and private health service providers;

About GI-ESCR

The Global Initiative for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (GI-ESCR) is an international non-governmental human rights advocacy organisation. Together with partners around the world, GI-ESCR works to end social, economic and gender injustice using a human rights approach.

Contact

The Global Initiative on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (GI-ESCR).



For further information on this publication, please contact Rossella De Falco, Programme Officer on the Right to Health rosselgi-escr.org or Roselyne Onyango, Associate Programme Officer – Africa rosselgi-escr.org.

© 2023 Global Initiative for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.